1	TOWN BOARD COUNTY OF ALBANY	
2	TOWN OF COLONIE	
3	**************************************	
5	BEGINNING JANUARY 1, 2020	
6	THE STENOGRAPHIC MINUTES of the above entitled matter by NANCY L. STRANG, a Shorthand Reporter commencing on	
7	November 7, 2019 at 7:35 p.m. at Memorial Town Hall, 534 New Loudon Road, Latham, New York	
8		
9	BOARD MEMBERS:	
10	PAULA MAHAN, SUPERVISOR LINDA MURPHY, DEPUTY SUPERVISOR	
11	DAVID GREEN MELISSA JEFFERS-VONDOLLEN	
12	PAUL ROSANO CHRISTOPHER CAREY	
13		
14	ALSO PRESENT:	
15	Michael C. Magguilli, Esq, Town Attorney Julie Gansle, Town Clerk	
16	P. Christopher Kelsey, Acting Comptroller Rick Field	
17	Jerry Russell	
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
į		

MS. GANSLE: This public hearing is being held by order of the Town Board to hear all persons in relation to the budget of the Town of Colonie for the fiscal year beginning January 1, 2020.

2.4

Notice of the public hearing has been published in the official Town newspaper which is the Spotlight and also in the Times Union. In addition, the notice has been posted on the Town Clerk's bulletin Board. I have an affidavit for each.

The Town Board will now hear all persons interested in this matter.

SUPERVISOR MAHAN: We're going to run through the budget and as you can see on the screen, you will be able to follow along with us and if you have any questions, we will have time after to answer any questions that you might have.

This is the 2020 proposed budget.

As you can see on the screen, this is a description of the budget process.

In May 2019 the budget worksheets were issued to all departments. The departments were advised to submit budgets that are cost-effective while maintaining a high quality of services.

June through October 2019, the budget review committee worked with the department heads to review

1 all budget requests. The Committee consisted of 2 representatives from the Comptroller's, DPW which is 3 the Department of Public Works, Information Systems, Police, Civil Service and the Supervisor's office. 4 5 We eliminated approximately \$685,000 in requests. 7 September 26, 2019 a tentative budget was filed with the Town Clerk. 9 November 7, 2019 a preliminary budget public 10 hearing, which is tonight. 11 On November 20, 2019 is the deadline for us 12 to adopt the budget. 13 Year-round our Budget Committee monitors actual activity versus the budget and makes 14 15 recommended budget modifications. 16 MR. KELSEY: This is just a summary of the last 17 eight years of budgets. You can see the 2020 budget is 18 at the bottom. 19 Approximately \$99.4 million which is a \$3.8 20 million increase and a 4% change year over year. That 21 increase is primarily from contractual salary 22 increases and health insurance. 23 SUPERVISOR MAHAN: The general fund consists of 2.4 all of our administrative departments; Historian, Pruyn 25 House, Parks and Recreation, Community Services, Senior

Resources, our Police, EMS, Emergency Management,
Building and Fire Services and Justice and our Planning
and Department of Public Works and Engineering.

Other funds in special districts include
Highway, Library, Latham Water District and Pure
Waters District.

2.0

2.4

There are two on the bottom - Latham Water District and Pure Waters District and they are considered special districts. They have their own source of revenue derived from water and usage charges.

A lot of the Resolutions that you have heard tonight from Crystal, who presented the three public hearings, are all part of the Pure Waters District.

So, any of the usage fees — anything that involves

Pure Waters — those fees and costs go to that particular department. They are not in the general fund for us to use.

The same thing with the Latham Water District.

MR. KELSEY: One of the other funds is the William K. Sanford Library. The preliminary budget for 2020 is approximately \$3.1 million. It is funded solely by the Town's property tax rate and is included in the estimated 3.99 per thousand rate that we are proposing

for 2020. Of that 3.99 rate, about 47 1/2 cents goes directly to fund the library. So, for an average homeowner in the Town for 2020, you are contributing \$67.44 towards the operation of the library. That is somewhat up in 2020. Again, similar to the overall Town budget, payroll benefits and now the debt service related to the almost \$3 million renovations that have been going into the library at this point.

2.4

To break out in more detail of where the funding actually goes for the \$99 million budget, \$42.1 million is payroll.

Again, we have seven unions in the Town. That was negotiated over a four-year contract and most of the employees are receiving either a 2% or 2 1/2% rate increase after taking pay freezes in 2017 and 2018.

Capital items in the budget were reduce the share to conserve on spending. Operations is \$19.3 million. That \$400,000 increase is primarily in contractual items related to the operation of the Water Department and the Sewer Department. Of the sewer, we have a large component of that that we paid to the Albany County Sewer District and that is where a lot of the funding for the Sewer Department is going towards this year.

The debt service a \$700,000 - approximately two-thirds of that relates to the highway, sewer and water improvements that are being done throughout the Town in about \$66,000 this year relates to the library renovations.

2.0

2.4

Benefits is about \$1 million increase or \$25.8 million this year. That increase is \$900,000 of health insurance, premium increases and then the payroll taxes associated with the wage increases.

This kind of highlights the salaries again and talking about the raises and when the wage freezes were in that the union contracts over that four-year period equates to about 1 1/4% for the employees per year.

Since 2010, the Town is been able to eliminate 57 full-time positions due to attrition and retirement.

SUPERVISOR MAHAN: These are some of our major budget challenges. Maintaining a current level of high quality services while minimizing the impact on the taxpayers.

An uncertain economy - we know how things are right now. We don't know if things will change with the economy. We hope not. We have to keep that in mind.

1 The continued strain on major revenue sources 2 and unfunded mandates -- as Chris said earlier, the 3 increase in health insurance premium contributions. MR. KELSEY: Again, the main summary of the 4 5 budget again - the main thing to take away from this is the increase over 2019 for an average house is 8 1/2 7 cents per thousand. That translates to approximately \$11 for the year. In 2019 the median taxable value home in the 9 10 Town paid about \$597. In 2020 we are proposing about 11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

\$609 for a \$11.70 increase or less than \$.98 per month. On a Town that has a \$99 million budget, that's a pretty good increase in my opinion.

The assessed value growth in 2019 of \$71 million translated to a 1% savings in the rate. So, the assessed value growth does have a benefit to the taxpayers.

SUPERVISOR MAHAN: If you take a look at the pie chart, what we get is 10%.

The special districts - that is again Pure Waters and Latham Water District and fire districts, as well.

We have 12 volunteer fire departments in Town. So, that's 10%.

Albany County gets 14% and the school

district gets 66%. So, as you can see, the school district portion of what comes in goes directly to the school district and that's where your parents and the residents pay their taxes to - either South Colonie or North Colonie School District.

2.4

Again, Albany County is a separate tax. We don't get that money. We basically have to cover all of our general fund operations - everything that we do; salaries were 10%. You can see that that's just a small portion of the whole pie. We only get a small portion.

MR. KELSEY: We have so many revenue sources that it is easier to show it in a pie chart to see where the Town's revenues come from. Approximately 25% come from the property tax levies that we're talking about tonight. Approximately 12% come from what's called the ad valorem taxes on the special districts. Sales tax makes up 26%.

So, all you guys when you're done here, go to the mall and go shopping.

We've got fees for services which is again water, building permits, EMS - - that is 26%.

Our other fines and licenses from the Building Department and the Justice Court is about 22%. We are able to generate 5% on our properties

through rental and things like that - interest earnings and then we get about 4% from federal and state aid. Again, not a very big number that comes from the state.

2.4

SUPERVISOR MAHAN: So, the 2020 budget represents our best efforts to maintain an excellent quality of services for our residences and businesses, govern cost effectively and efficiently while identifying new cost savings programs.

This year we engaged in a hydroelectric project which is going to bring us additional revenue as well as help our environment. Also, we just entered into a program of converting 4,000 streetlights in the Town to LED streetlighting which is also all the way around. We continue to work to strengthen our financial position and that includes being able to maintain all of our costs, not have any deficits and to continue to build a reserve fund.

There is a New York State tax levy. We are within that this year again. So, basically when you look at your taxes - when your parents review their tax bills, now you be able to tell them were all this money goes.

As Chris said earlier, the increase is about 8 1/2 cents per thousand. That's 2%. What that means

is the average household will be about \$11 for the year. That's enough to cover what we need to cover.

2.4

That's pretty much it. I don't know if you guys have any questions. Certainly, if you ever want to look at our budget, it is a line item budget so you can take a look at it in whatever item you're looking for - what's included in certain departments, what the salaries are, what our costs are - with all of our revenue and cost expenses are there. If you want to review that it any time, you certainly can. Of course, as always, we are always open if anyone wants to come in and take a look at things to go over the finances. Our door has always been open for that as well.

Are there any questions?

MR. FIELD: Rick Field. I just wonder where the fines - where they go from the police force, for example, for speeding fines in that pie circle. Where does that go?

SUPERVISOR MAHAN: They go to the Justice Department. We don't get to keep all of the money.

MR. KELSEY: Basically the fees that are generated through the Justice Court - the Police

Department refers all the fees to the Justice Court.

They deal with all the Court. The state actually takes about 60% of everything that is generated to the Court.

The Court actually generates roughly - - I think last year they generated about \$800,000-\$900,000 and that pretty much goes to fund the operation of the Justice Court.

SUPERVISOR MAHAN: In your cities, they are funded by the Office of Court Administration. They get money for their Courts through that office. We are a Town so we have to cover it ourselves. We wish it was the same for everybody because that would make things a lot easier. Just so you kids understand, these fines that go to the Justice Department - that's not supposed to be a place where you make money. Everything has to be justified. It's not really a place where you're looking to keep generating revenue. It's a different type of a fee - the fines are.

Does that answer your question, Rick?

MR. FIELD: Yeah.

SUPERVISOR MAHAN: Anyone else?

Jennifer?

2.4

MS. WHALEN: Can you talk more about sales tax revenue and mortgage tax? I know you had made several remarks regarding our budget. Can you compare it to last year versus the anticipated projected mortgage tax and sales tax revenues for next year.

MR. KELSEY: Right now what we have budgeted

for 2020 is exactly what we have collected in 2019. I go back and I have done a 10 to 11 year history of our sales tax collection and we average about two percent growth a year. There are years where we had generated five percent as we did in 2018 and there are years when we had a two-thirds of a percent increase, which was in 2017.

MS. WHALEN: I know last year we were talking about this budget - - it feels like yesterday, actually. I remember between hearings there was some good news on the sales tax.

MR. KELSEY: Yes and sales tax has continued to grow which is why we have felt a little more confident in budgeting — it's exactly what we are collecting where in prior years we have left a slight cushion just in case of a recession. We have heard out there that there is a recession coming. So, what we have done this year is not budget any growth in the sales tax. So, we are not budgeting that 2% average growth. We are basically collecting what we have received dollar for dollar. That way, we're trying to be conservative — taking that approach, a slightly different approach and hoping that is benefiting the taxpayers that way.

As far as mortgage tax goes, we only receive that check twice a year. That's in July and January.

We have received the July check and that was about on average about 50% of what we budget. So, we are expecting to meet budget at \$2.6 million for 2019. We have not budgeted anymore for 2020. Again, it seems to have stabilized.

2.4

MR. ROSANO: Chris, I want to go over the Justice Court budget just briefly.

In 2018 the actual budget was \$697,500. In 2020 we are up to \$907,920. So, we had almost a \$200,000 increase in a little over two years. How has that been offset? Did we make up the difference somewhere? I am not understanding.

MR. KELSEY: Basically what ultimately happens is what you are looking at is direct operating costs of each department. On top of that there is approximately - benefit costs of approximately 55% on every payroll dollar goes to fund benefits which is later in the budget. So, the Justice Court fees have always gone to offset the direct operating costs plus their benefits. As their revenues have been coming down and expenses are going up, the other revenue sources within the Town general funds, sales tax, property tax and things like mortgage tax - those fill all those holes.

That's similar to EMS. EMS has direct operating costs of of roughly \$4 million. They've got

1 their benefit costs and they've got the fees that come 2 in that don't completely offset. So, the other revenue sources fill in the holes. 3 4 So, to answer your question, the Town is 5 kicking more towards the Justice Court that it used two because of the increase costs and the fees that 7 are coming down. Why it is up to hundred thousand dollars is because 2 1/2% raises and 2019 in 2020, as well as 9 10 there is a position of Law Clerk that the Justice 11 Court had requested. It was funded as a part-time 12 position in 2019 and then we were able to make it a full-time position in 2020 13 14 MS. WHALEN: And they are all union? 15 MR. KELSEY: All these employees are union 16 workers, other than the justices and the manager of the 17 department. 18 MS. WHALEN: And they are also getting the 19 increase that the laborers are getting under the union 2.0 contracts? 21 MR. KELSEY: Yes. The only point is that the 22 only raises this year are the special boards, the Town 23 Board and the Town Supervisor. 2.4 MR. ROSANO: Chris, I guess my question is what 25 were hearing on the news is they're talking about bail

1	reform coming possibly in January. How much damage in
2	overtime and payroll is that going to do to us if that
3	goes through the way that they have it structured now? I
4	know that's a crystal ball question.
5	MR. KELSEY: I cannot answer that question.
6	MR. ROSANO: But it's going to affect us.
7	MR. MAGGUILLI: It's going to be a disaster.
8	MR. KELSEY: The Police Department in the
9	Justice Court, yes. At this point, we don't know.
10	MR. ROSANO: So, in essence, that itself - that
11	just itself will put us over the tax cap next year. In
12	my correct on that?
13	MR. KELSEY: I can give you estimates on that.
14	MR. ROSANO: Comptrollers don't do that.
15	MR. KELSEY: Accountants look backwards, they
16	don't look forward.
17	MR. ROSANO: That's why am asking that
18	question. Okay, thank you.
19	MR. MAGGUILLI: I can tell you the effect in my
20	office. We are the prosecutors of all vehicle and
21	traffic offenses in the Town of Colonie up to vehicle
22	and traffic Law misdemeanors. We enforce all Town Code
23	violations. We are subject to the new criminal justice
24	reform that was passed by the State of New York and not
25	a thought was given as to how we are supposed to fund

our response to this new law. We are required under this new statute, which will go into effect January 1, to provide all discovery within 15 days from the date a ticket is issued.

2.4

Right now we estimate just the new discovery requirements alone would justify two new paralegals so we can be in compliance with the law and virtually not have to dismiss every case that is filed against us. This is an unfunded mandate with a U and the M. How we are going to deal with it - we are struggling with it every day.

SUPERVISOR MAHAN: It's a question that came up at a recent Municipal Leaders Meeting. The Mayors and Supervisors in the whole capital region in mostly Albany County -- they're all struggling with the same questions. This is going to change things quite a bit. It is going to have quite an impact on our Police Department and our Justice Department and the Attorney's office.

Again, everyone is struggling with this to really get some direction as to how we get through this. Most likely, it's going to end up staying as an unfunded mandate.

Did that answer all your questions, Paul?
MR. ROSANO: Yes.

SUPERVISOR MAHAN: Getting back to the sales tax what Chris was saying - it's important to watch the trends over a good five-year period because it fluctuates. As the economy fluctuates, the sales tax fluctuate. We try to get as close to an average that we feel comfortable with rather than getting a spike and then putting that on the budget and saying we can have that. We might not have that same amount next year. So, we're very cautious with it, but we are pleased with how it's been coming in. We do have to maintain a conservative approach when we are looking at that.

There is talk of a possible recession. If you talk to financial people, they are saying another year or two - if it's going to happen. It may not be as bad as the one was in 2008 which was extremely tough to deal with. Let's pray we don't have that again. These are all things that we really have to take a look back and then project as we move forward as to what is a safe number to be at. That seems to keep us on track the best possible way that we can.

We talked about cutting items out of the budget request. That's because the department heads first come in and they come in with their budget needs. Just like everything else, we are all asked to prioritize. If we need to fill in for some places

that's not getting enough revenue, that's where that comes in, as well. Department heads will take a look at the requests to see if they could possibly put this particular item for this particular project — can we move it out a few years and that way it gives us time to be able to manage that, as well.

2.4

It's a very collaborative process. It's a very long process and something that has to be modified continually.

We do get the reports - the monthly reports so we can take a look at the budget and what is being spent. We talk about budget modifications.

If you look at Resolutions to make a budget modification, that means we may need something here and there may be a little extra here. So, we move that over through the budget modification. It is budget neutral and you can take a look and see what it is right in the Resolution.

As I say, it's a very user-friendly and easy to understand. We are always here if anybody has any further questions.

MR. KELSEY: One other piece of business that I forgot to mention earlier: In the proposed budget that the Board is going to act on this evening - it is slightly less than the tentative budget and the

1 preliminary budget in the area of Pure Waters. Our 2 Superintendent reviewed his revenue estimates with the Budget Committees revenue estimates. He felt that we 3 4 were a little aggressive in one area and requested a 5 \$25,000 reduction in the outside fees. He was generous enough to give us a piece of capital equipment out of 7 the budget to offset that directly, so the overall 8 budget is \$25,000 less then it was when it was presented to the Board as a tentative budget and the public as 9 10 preliminary. That needs to be put on the record. 11 MS. WHALEN: Could you repeat again what the average median household increase will be estimated at? 12 13 MR. KELSEY: That's \$11.70. 14 So, what is the median - the MS. WHALEN: 15 average? 16 MR. KELSEY: It's a taxable value of the 17 \$142,000 and equates to about a market value of roughly 18 \$225,000 to \$230,000 according to Ron Monfils, our 19 Assessor. 20 MS. WHALEN: So, what would it be if it was 21 like \$600,000, let's say. 22 MR. KELSEY: You would have to take the 23 \$600,000 assessed value times our equalization rate of 2.4 62.5 and multiply that times the 8 1/2 cents. I'm not 25 that fast with numbers. I do everything with a

1 calculator to make sure that I am right. 2 SUPERVISOR MAHAN: You're not multiplying times 3 100%. 4 MS. WHALEN: But roughly what would that be? 5 You must've run a number. MR. KELSEY: No, I haven't. You've got your 6 7 phone there, Jennifer. That's a calculator. Do 600,000 625 and divide that by 1,000 and multiply it times .085. 9 10 MS. WHALEN: That's \$31. Could it go over the 11 tax cap, if the projected revenue -12 MR. KELSEY: No. The tax cap is not a raised 13 cap. The tax cap is a levy cap. We can raise no more than this year 3% of what we raised the prior year. So, 14 15 any assessed value growth only reduces the impact to the 16 rate pair which is why the rate pair is paying 2% and 17 not a 3% because we had \$71 million in assessed value 18 growth which reduces the rate to the taxpayer. So, it 19 does not go over the tax cap and cannot go over the tax cap and that's just the way it is this year. 20 21 MS. WHALEN: So, even if the projected revenues 22 are less -23 MR. KELSEY: The tax levy is the tax levy. What 2.4 we will do after this budget is adopted, we send it to 25 the county and they approve it as part of our annual

warrant. They can form their taxes and that's what we are able to collect. They put out the tax bills and we can collect no more than that, unless there is a court ordered adjustment. So, no, we can only collect that and it is not over the cap and will not be over the cap this year.

2.4

MS. WHALEN: I just have another question. So, the raises that we are giving pursuant to the contract - the labor union contracts are one thing. To those folks who are not covered by those contracts, how many people are getting raises and what would you estimate of this increase their raises comprise of this increase.

MR. KELSEY: This is a similar question that you asked last year. It's roughly about 50 people and equates to about \$100,000. That's the management group, the employees in the Comptroller's office, the employees in the Human Resources office, the employees in the Attorney's office and the employees in the Supervisor's office. Those are the only four offices in the Town that are not covered by the union. Everyone else is a union employee, other than the managers.

MS. WHALEN: What about the golf course? The golf pro is covered by a union contract?

MR. KELSEY: They are all union employees.

SUPERVISOR MAHAN: He is also a manager. He is

1	a golf pro, but he is a manager of that department.
2	MS. WHALEN: Of what department? The Parks and
3	rec department?
4	MR. KELSEY: No, the golf course.
5	MS. WHALEN: The golf course department?
6	SUPERVISOR MAHAN: Yes, the golf course is part
7	of Parks and Rec.
8	MS. WHALEN: Is that typical in municipalities?
9	Are they full-time employees all year long?
10	MR. KELSEY: As far as we are aware of, yes.
11	SUPERVISOR MAHAN: At municipal courses, yes.
12	The reason that we look at the median is because that's
13	where most of the houses fall in the entire Town. You
14	will have a smaller portion that is less so we estimate
15	\$11 a month. Then, you will have a smaller portion that
16	will be higher than most. So, the median is the majority
17	of the people. That's the range of those houses. It
18	gives us a good point to start from. For the median
19	price for houses it's about \$.98 a month. It's not \$98.
20	It's \$.98.
21	Any other questions?
22	MS. JEFFERS-VONDOLLEN: I've a question. This
23	is only my second rodeo at the budget, so can you just
24	define the \$71 million of assessed value growth - just
25	what that encompasses - just so I can get an idea. I

1	don't remember the figures honestly.
2	MR. KELSEY: Our assessed value - and I don't
3	have it in front of me - is in the billions. That number
4	is provided to us by the Town Assessor. He would be a
5	better person to ask as to what encompasses that growth.
6	MS. JEFFERS-VONDOLLEN: Thank you, Chris.
7	MR. RUSSELL: Hi, I'm Jerry Russell and my
8	question is: Based on the budget distribution, who gets
9	more; North Colonie or South Colonie School District.
10	That's for the school district distribution for the
11	money?
12	MR. KELSEY: Our Town budget has nothing to do
13	with the school districts. That's the School Board and
14	they are their own independent governments. So, this
15	doesn't actually address any funding of the schools.
16	MS. WHALEN: That's an excellent question,
17	though.
18	MR. RUSSELL: So, 66% is even between the two
19	schools?
20	MR. KELSEY: You would have to look at those
21	two school budgets. I don't know them off-hand.
22	SUPERVISOR MAHAN: The actual rate - they are
23	pretty close.
24	MS. WHALEN: Are you asking because you saw
25	that pie chart?

1 MR. KELSEY: For every dollar of property tax 2 that your parents pay, \$.66 on the dollar goes to the school. Hence, \$.14 goes to the county, \$.10 comes to 3 4 the Town and \$.10 goes to to the districts. That's what 5 we're kind of highlighting there. The rates for the two schools - I believe North Colonie is \$27 per thousand 7 and I think South Colonie is at \$26 a thousand. I think they are pennies of that. I think their budgets are 9 pretty close. SUPERVISOR MAHAN: Your school district has a 10 11 School Board. Each school district has a School Board 12 and those School Boards are independent of the Town. 13 They propose their own rates based on their budgets. MR. KELSEY: Actually, your parents vote on 14 15 that in May of every year to set the school budget for 16 the following year. 17 MR. RUSSELL: So, you guys don't give any money 18 to athletics or anything like that? 19 MR. KELSEY: No, we don't fund any of that 20 stuff for the schools. Indirectly, if they use our facilities, we don't typically charge the schools. So, 21 22 they are both treated equitably in that case. But we 23 don't do any direct funding to the schools. 2.4 SUPERVISOR MAHAN: I don't know if the cities

25

do.

1	MR. KELSEY: The cities do because those are
2	incorporated in the cities.
3	MR. RUSSELL: Okay, thank you.
4	SUPERVISOR MAHAN: You're welcome. Good
5	question.
6	MS. WHALEN: Good question. Way to go for
7	coming up and asking it.
8	SUPERVISOR MAHAN: Any other questions?
9	(There was no response.)
10	Thank you to all the department heads and
11	some of you are here tonight. We know it's a difficult
12	process to go through and we appreciate all the time
13	and effort that you put into the budgets and
14	prioritize so that we can do this budget every year.
15	So, thank you very much.
16	We will close his public hearing. We can vote
17	tonight on this if no one else has any questions. We
18	haven't received any questions over the past month and
19	a half. If you guys want to vote tonight, we can.
20	MS. GANSLE: So, we have a Resolution adopting
21	the proposed 2020 annual budget.
22	MR. GREEN: So moved.
23	MS. JEFFERS-VONDOLLEN: Second.
24	SUPERVISOR MAHAN: Supervisor votes aye. Clerk,
25	call the roll.

1	MS. GANSLE: Councilman Rosano?
2	MR. ROSANO: Aye.
3	MS. GANSLE: Whalen?
4	MS. WHALEN: No.
5	MS. GANSLE: VonDollen?
6	MS. JEFFERS-VONDOLLEN: Aye.
7	MS. GANSLE: Murphy?
8	MS. MURPHY: Aye.
9	MS. GANSLE: Green?
10	MR. GREEN: Aye.
11	MS. GANSLE: Carey?
12	MR. CAREY: Aye.
13	MS. GANSLE: The ayes have it, Madam
14	Supervisor.
15	SUPERVISOR MAHAN: The Resolution is adopted.
16	I'm not quite sure, but did you have another
17	question, Jennifer?
18	MS. WHALEN: No, I don't. It's just pretty much
19	the same thing as last year. I just don't really believe
20	that upper management that aren't part of the union
21	should be entitled when we have to raise taxes for the
22	same reasons as the laborers.
23	SUPERVISOR MAHAN: What I can say is that when
24	we look at the budget and we look at the increases or no
25	increases, whatever it may be, as costs go up for

everybody, and you look at it across the entire staff in their costs increase as well. So, that's the way we've always looked at it.

2.4

MS. WHALEN: No, I know. I remember this from last year. I still believe that sometimes you have to do more with less and I haven't changed my mind on that.

I looked very carefully at the budget. Every department made a lot of effort to actually decrease supplies in the numbers actually went down. I am accepting of the union contracts, but in the years leading up - I just don't really think we should be giving raises to basically political appointees and raising taxes on the residents.

SUPERVISOR MAHAN: Just so you understand
MS. WHALEN: I'm sorry, but I was an appointee

and I didn't get raises. I still went to work as a

public servant and I loved my job.

SUPERVISOR MAHAN: You are certainly entitled to your opinion.

When we talk about development - I guess it is subjective, but the reality is and what you have to understand is for every 1% of a Town our size we only get about \$240,000. That means when you look across all the homes that cover 57 miles, all the businesses - \$240,000. So, when you look, it's not like the

growth and development - - sometimes people hear the number of the total assessed value increasing and they think that we get all of that money. That's not the way it works. The formula for the tax cap - that's what we get: \$240,000 and the tax cap started with getting probably close to \$140,000 or \$150,000. It's a very very minimal amount of money. That's what we get when you look at any new development or whatever. Yes, it does help to keep the taxes low.

The other side of that is that anything beyond that formula that is in excess of that - that goes back to the residents in their taxes and that's what helps to keep their tax rate low. That's how that works. I just was wondering if we didn't answer all your questions, that's all.

(Whereas the above entitled proceeding was concluded at 8:03 p.m)

CERTIFICATION

I, NANCY L. STRANG, Shorthand Reporter and Notary Public in and for the State of New York, hereby CERTIFY that the record taken by me at the time and place noted in the heading hereof is a true and accurate transcript of same, to the best of my ability and belief.

10 Dated:_____

NANCY L. STRANG

LEGAL TRANSCRIPTION

2420 TROY SCHENECTADY RD.

NISKAYUNA, NY 12309